ASSESSING THE POTENTIAL OF EU AGENCIES FOR THE FUTURE OF EU-TURKEY RELATIONS, PART 2: A SYSTEMATIC MAPPING OF COOPERATION BETWEEN EU AGENCIES AND TURKEY (1999–2021)

Michael Kaeding

Executive Summary

To showcase the dynamics and potential of EU agencies for EU-Turkey relations, this contribution focuses on Turkey’s role across EU agencies, mapping its bilateral and ad hoc working arrangements with them (1999–2021). This year, Turkey has engaged with 18 out of 34 decentralized EU agencies. Turkey’s involvement in EU agencies is manifold, covers various policy areas, and has proven itself for more than 20 years. For the future of EU-Turkey relations, EU agencies seem to offer a valuable “participatory form of external differentiation” worth pursuing for both the EU and Turkey.
Introduction

The future of Europe is one of external differentiated integration,¹ in which non-member states of the EU participate in shaping future policies. To showcase the dynamic and potential nature of EU agencies for Turkey, we map Turkey’s different types of engagement between 1999 and 2021. This analysis builds upon a systematic study of information drawn from the relevant official documents provided by EU agencies and the European Commission, founding acts, and reports. Reporting all bilateral and ad hoc working arrangements between EU agencies and Turkey over time, we show that Turkey’s involvement in EU agencies is manifold, covers various policy areas, and has proven itself for more than 20 years. To conclude, we discuss the implications for the future of EU-Turkey relations.

Systematic Mapping of Cooperation between EU Agencies and Turkey over Time (1999–2021)

The first conditions for Turkey’s participation in EU agencies were determined by the European Commission’s “Communication on a European Strategy for Turkey” in March 1998. Following Turkey’s recognition as a candidate country in 1999, Turkey eventually gained the right to participate in EU agencies more systematically.

Building on Rimkutė and Shyrokhkh’s work² on EU agencies’ role in the acquis transfer in ENP countries, we distinguish between special bilateral agreements and ad hoc arrangements. Special bilateral agreements establish sustained institutionalized links between an EU agency and Turkey, focusing on technical collaboration. Technical ad hoc arrangements are temporal Instrument for Pre-Accession Assistance (IPA) projects based on technical and/or scientific activities aimed at institutional and technical capacity building in Turkey. Accordingly, collaboration between EU agencies and Turkey can take three forms: bilateral working agreements, ad hoc arrangements, or a combination of both.

Figure 1. Types of Cooperation between EU Agencies and Turkey (1999–2021)

Source: Author’s own compilation
Figure 1 illustrates that, as of 2021, a total of 18 out of 34 decentralized EU agencies (see Annex 1) engage with Turkey. EU agencies have opened for Turkey’s participation at different points in time, proposing different forms and combinations of cooperation.

Most agencies (12 out of 18) collaborate on a technical ad hoc basis exclusively, while four EU agencies (EEA, EASA, EMCDDA, and Frontex) engage via both bilateral working and ad hoc technical arrangements: European Environment Agency (EEA), European Aviation Safety Agency (EASA), European Monitoring Centre for Drug Abuse and Drug Addiction (EMCDDA) and European Boarder Control Agency (Frontex).

Cooperation between EU agencies and Turkey started before the official opening of accession negotiations in 2005, with the EEA in 2003 and Europol in 2004. Both the EEA and Europol work in interconnected issue areas characterized by higher interdependencies with Turkey. While Europol is a “law enforcement agency supporting in preventing and combating all forms of serious international and organised crime, cybercrime and terrorism,” the EEA provides “sound, independent information on the environment for those involved in developing, adopting, implementing and evaluating environmental policy.”

Another series of bilateral working arrangements and ad hoc arrangements started emerging once the practical negotiations on the 35 chapters of the acquis began in June 2006. EU agencies working in both policy areas characterized by higher, but also lower, sector-specific/functional interdependencies showed immediate interest in Turkey. As for sectors with higher sector-specific/functional interdependencies, these included agencies such as the EASA (2006), which is “responsible for setting the rules, guidelines and standards for all safety and environmental aspects of civil aviation,” and EMCDDA (2007), which offers a “factual overview of European drug problems and a solid evidence base to support the drugs debate. Today it offers policymakers the data they need for drawing up informed drug laws and strategies.” These EU agencies operate in the field of transportation and drug and human trafficking, i.e., interconnected issue areas with higher interdependencies.

Additionally, there is the European Medicine Agency (EMA, 2006), which is “responsible for the scientific evaluation, supervision and safety monitoring of medicines in the EU”; the European Food Safety Agency (EFSA, 2007), which is a “source of scientific advice and communication on risks associated with the food chain”; the EU-OSHA (2007), which raises “awareness of occupational safety and health (OSH) topics across Europe and providing, amongst others, online risk assessment tools for small and medium-sized enterprises to assess and manage risks in the workplace”; the European Chemical Agency (ECHA, 2009), which implements the EU’s chemical regulations “to protect people and the environment from the hazards of chemicals. It develops independent scientific and technical opinions and takes binding decisions to ensure that chemicals companies comply with European law.” Most of these EU agencies cover policy areas such as pharmaceuticals, food safety, social regulation issues, and chemicals, which are characterized by lower sector-specific interdependencies.

Between 2009 and 2016 an additional six EU agencies started cooperating with Turkey. By 2016, when the European Parliament voted to suspend accession negotiations with Turkey over human rights and rule of law concerns, 15 EU agencies in total had established forms of cooperation with Turkey.

Even after the official “stop” of accession negotiations in 2018, technical ad hoc arrangements between EU agencies and Turkey continued mainly in sectors with high sector-specific interdependence covering the fields of transportation, European Maritime Safety Agency (EMSA in 2018), migration (EASO in 2019), and the COVID-19 pandemic (ECDC in 2020).

Policy Outlook and Recommendations

Next to the first policy brief focusing on Turkey’s particular role in the EEA and the EMCDDA, this policy brief broadens the perspective and shows that Turkey has been successfully drawn into the EU’s broader transgovernmental networks—even before the official accession procedure started and long after the current enlargement talks were frozen. In 2021, a total of 18 out of 34 decentralized EU agencies have been engaged with Turkey.
Lately, we see that EU agencies have continued and extended their engagement with Turkey despite the freezing of accession talks, which might hint at the potential for EU agencies to reach out to Turkey.

In times where Turkey’s relationship has become extremely complex and dynamic, “a new institutional framework, termed a “dynamic association”, that would be complementary to Turkey’s albeit stalled accession process”¹⁴ would therefore need to reflect on the continued potential of EU agencies as a “participatory form of external differentiation”¹⁵ in essential areas of joint interest, such as migration, counter-terrorism, economy, trade, energy, and transport.¹⁶

For the future of EU-Turkey relations, EU agencies seem to be a valuable asset for Turkey and the EU alike in times of an uncertain road to EU membership. Decentralized EU agencies already present a flexible mechanism for multi-fold cooperation trajectories, i.e., a form of transgovernmental outreach toward Turkey resulting in continued sector-specific policy diffusion, policy transfer, and regulatory approximation.
Endnotes


3 | For a detailed overview of tasks of all 18 EU agencies see Annex 2.


12 | For a more detailed academic assessment of Turkey’s engagement with EU agencies please see Kaeding and Milenkovic 2021.


### Annex 1: Overview of all 34 decentralized EU agencies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Founding Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACER</td>
<td>European Union Agency for the Cooperation of Energy Regulators</td>
<td>Ljubljana (Slovenia)</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CdT</td>
<td>Translation Centre For the Bodies of the EU</td>
<td>Luxembourg (Luxembourg)</td>
<td>1994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cedefop</td>
<td>European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training</td>
<td>Thessaloniki (Greece)</td>
<td>1975</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEPOL</td>
<td>European Union Agency for Law Enforcement Training</td>
<td>Budapest (Hungary)</td>
<td>2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPVO</td>
<td>Community Plant Variety Office</td>
<td>Angers (France)</td>
<td>1995</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cedefop</td>
<td>European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training</td>
<td>Thessaloniki (Greece)</td>
<td>1975</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EASA</td>
<td>European Aviation Safety Agency</td>
<td>Köln (Germany)</td>
<td>2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EASO</td>
<td>European Asylum Support Office</td>
<td>Valletta (Malta)</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EBA</td>
<td>European Banking Authority</td>
<td>Paris (France)</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECDC</td>
<td>European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control</td>
<td>Stockholm (Sweden)</td>
<td>2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECHA</td>
<td>European Chemicals Agency</td>
<td>Helsinki (Finland)</td>
<td>2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFCA</td>
<td>European Fisheries Control Agency</td>
<td>Vigo (Spain)</td>
<td>2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFSAs</td>
<td>European Food Safety Agency</td>
<td>Parma (Italy)</td>
<td>2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EIGE</td>
<td>European Institute for Gender Equality</td>
<td>Vilnius (Lithuania)</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EIOPA</td>
<td>European Insurance and Occupational Pensions Authority</td>
<td>Frankfurt am Main (Germany)</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELA</td>
<td>European Labour Authority</td>
<td>Bratislava (Slovak Republic)</td>
<td>2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMA</td>
<td>European Medicine Agency</td>
<td>Amsterdam (The Netherlands)</td>
<td>1995</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMCDDA</td>
<td>European Monitoring Centre for Drugs and Drug Addiction</td>
<td>Lisbon (Portugal)</td>
<td>1993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMSA</td>
<td>European Maritime Safety Agency</td>
<td>Lisbon (Portugal)</td>
<td>2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENISA</td>
<td>European Union Agency for Cybersecurity</td>
<td>Heraklion (Greece)</td>
<td>2004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ERA</td>
<td>European Railway Agency</td>
<td>Valenciennes (France)</td>
<td>2004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESMA</td>
<td>European Securities and Markets Authority</td>
<td>Paris (France)</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ETF</td>
<td>European Training Foundation</td>
<td>Turin (Italy)</td>
<td>1994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EEA</td>
<td>European Environment Agency</td>
<td>Copenhagen (Denmark)</td>
<td>1990</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EUROPEAN</td>
<td>European Union Intellectual Property Office</td>
<td>Alicante (Spain)</td>
<td>1994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU-LISA</td>
<td>European Union Agency for the Operational Management of Large-Scale IT Systems in the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice</td>
<td>Tallinn (Estonia)</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU-OSHA</td>
<td>European Agency for Safety and Health at Work</td>
<td>Bilbao (Spain)</td>
<td>1994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EUROFOUND</td>
<td>European Foundation for the improvement of Living and Working Conditions</td>
<td>Dublin (Ireland)</td>
<td>1975</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Annex 2. Overview of tasks of 18 EU agencies engaging with Turkey (2021)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EU AGENCY</th>
<th>MANDATE AND OBJECTIVES</th>
<th>LEGISLATIVE BASIS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| CEPOL        | • improves EU security through providing training for the police and other law enforcement officials, as well as knowledge sharing | • Established in 2005: Council Decision 2005/681/JHA of 20 September 2005 establishing the European Police College (CEPOL) and repealing Decision 2000/820/JHA  

Source: https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/agencies_de (1.8.2021)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EU AGENCY</th>
<th>MANDATE AND OBJECTIVES</th>
<th>LEGISLATIVE BASIS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>ECDC</strong></td>
<td>• strengthening the EU’s fight against infectious diseases by analyzing and evaluating data, providing scientific advice to EU governments and institutions, as well as in the field of education and early detection</td>
<td>• Established in 2004 (took up work in 2005): Regulation (EC) No 851/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 21 April 2004 establishing a European Centre for disease prevention and control (in force)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU AGENCY</td>
<td>MANDATE AND OBJECTIVES</td>
<td>LEGISLATIVE BASIS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| EIGE      | • works on gender equality through providing studies and statistics, e.g., the Gender Equality Index  
• supports EU institutions, member states, and stakeholders to reduce gender inequalities | • Established in 2006 (took up work in 2010): Regulation (EC) No 1922/2006 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 20 December 2006 on establishing a European Institute for Gender Equality  
| EMA       | • protects and promotes human and animal health by authorizing and monitoring medicines in the EU and the EEA  
• supports the development of medicines, evaluates applications for marketing authorization, and provides information to healthcare workers and patients | • Established in 1993 (took up work in 1995): Council Regulation (EEC) No 2309/93 of 22 July 1993 laying down Community procedures for the authorization and supervision of medicinal products for human and veterinary use and establishing a European Agency for the Evaluation of Medicinal Products (replaced)  
| EMCDDA    | • monitors drug problems in Europe, provides information, and develops tools and instruments applied to drug-related problems | • Established in 1993: Council Regulation (EEC) No 302/93 of 8 February 1993 on the establishment of a European Monitoring Centre for Drugs and Drug Addiction (repealed)  
| EMSA      | • supports governments and authorities to improve maritime safety, pollution preparedness and response, and maritime security  
| ERA       | • promotes the integration of the European railway systems, improves the safety of trains, and develops safety measures and targets | • Established in 2004: Regulation (EC) No 881/2004 of the European Parliament and Council of 29 April 2004 establishing a European Railway Agency (repealed)  
| ETF       | • promotes social mobility and inclusion, reforms education, and supports the improvement of the labor market | • Established in 1990 (took up work in 1994): Council Regulation (EEC) No 1360/90 of 7 May 1990 establishing a European Training Foundation (repealed)  
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EU AGENCY</th>
<th>MANDATE AND OBJECTIVES</th>
<th>LEGISLATIVE BASIS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| EU-OSHA   | • supports making workplaces safer and healthier  
            • analyzes and disseminates information, supports risk prevention, and provides tools for good OSH management | • Established in 1994: Council Regulation (EC) No 2062/94 of 18 July 1994 establishing a European Agency for Safety and Health at Work (repealed)  
| Eurofound | • provides knowledge in the field of social, employment, and work-related policies to provide a base for policy measures  
            • research projects on working conditions, quality of life and company practices | • Established in 1975: Regulation (EEC) No 1365/75 of the Council of 26 May 1975 on the creation of a European Foundation for the improvement of living and working conditions (repealed)  
| Eurojust  | • supports EU countries in the fight against terrorism and serious organized crime (affecting more than one EU country)  
            • coordination of investigations and prosecutions: establishment and implementation of EU-wide remedies  
            • organizes coordination meetings and finances and provides expertise for joint investigation teams and establishes coordination centers | • Established in 2002: Council Decision of 28 February 2002 setting up Eurojust with a view to reinforcing the fight against serious crime (2002/187/JHA)  
| Europol   | • assists national law enforcement agencies in combating serious international crime and terrorism  
            • provides information exchange on criminal activities and enables law enforcement operations  
            • produces long-term analyses of crime and terrorism | • Europol Convention was signed in 1995 (commenced its full activities in 1999): COUNCIL ACT of 26 July 1995 drawing up the Convention based on Article K.3 of the Treaty on European Union, on the establishment of a European Police Office (Europol Convention) (95/C 316/01)  
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EU AGENCY</th>
<th>MANDATE AND OBJECTIVES</th>
<th>LEGISLATIVE BASIS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Frontex   | • supports EU countries and associated Schengen states in the **management of their external borders**  
            • facilitates **cooperation between border authorities** in each EU country  

Sources:  
https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/agencies/cepol;  
https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/agencies/easa;  
https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/agencies/ecdc;  
https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/agencies/ECHA;  
https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/agencies/EFSA;  
https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/agencies/EIGE;  
https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/agencies/emcdda_en;  
https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/agencies/ems;  
https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/agencies/ERA;  
https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/agencies/EU-OSHA;  
https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/agencies/eurofound_en;  
https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/agencies/eurojust_de;  
https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/agencies/europol_de;  
https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/agencies/frontex_en (accessed on 1 September 2021)
Michael Kaeding is a professor of European Integration and European Union Politics in the Department of Political Science at the University of Duisburg-Essen, Germany and 2020/21 Mercator-IPC Fellow at IPC.

12 p.; 30 cm. - (Istanbul Policy Center-Sabancı University-Stiftung Mercator Initiative)

Cover Design and Page Layout: MYRA

Istanbul Policy Center
Bankalar Caddesi Minerva Han No: 2 Kat: 4
34420 Karaköy-Istanbul
T +90 212 292 49 39
ipc@sabanciuniv.edu - ipc@sabanciuniv.edu